Imaging Black Holes: Past, Present, and Future

Heimo Falcke Radboud University, Nijmegen



Event Horizon Telescope Collaboration







BLACK ERC Synergy Grant Co-PIs: L. Rezzolla (U. Frankfurt) M. Kramer (MPIfR Bonn)



How a black hole looks like

Radboud University Nijmegen



"Image of a star orbiting a black hole"

Cunningham & Bardeen (1973)



"Photos" of a black hole





Radboud University Nijmegen

Photos of a black hole



Luminet (1979)

Viergutz (1993, A&A)



Sgr A* spectrum: starved black hole, jet, accretion flow, shadow





Different Theories of Gravity Different Shadows



Radboud University Nijmegen

Kerr Black Supraspinning 8 8 Kerr-Taub-NUT Black Hole Hole a = 0.999**Black Hole** a = 1.001 $\theta = 60^{\circ}$ 6 $\mathbf{R} = \mathbf{0}$ $\theta = 60^{\circ}$ 4 2 2 3 -8 -6 -4-8-24 6 8 2 4 6 8 -4 .6 a = 0.99 $i = 90^{\circ}$ -6 -6 I = 0.1, 0.5, 0.9(dashed-dotted) 5 -5-8 -8Kaluza-Klein Rotating Dilaton Iohannsen & Psaltis -0.5Tomimatsu-Sato (TS2) space time **Black Hole** no-hair violation ---- 0.0 --- 0.5 5 5 y' (M) B 0 0 0 -5a = 0.5a = 0 -5 a = 0.4-5 $i = 90^{\circ}$ $i = 90^{\circ}$ i = 75 ° Q = 0, 0.5, 1.1298 (dotted) TS2 & Kerr (dotted) -5 5 5 0 -5 0 -5 0 5 x'(M) α

Falcke & Markoff, Class. & Quant. Gravity (2013, review)

The radio jet in M87 (Virgo A) adboud University Nijmegen



Elliptical galaxy in center of Virgo cluster at d=17 Mpc

 $1000 \times \text{more massive}$, $1000 \times \text{more distant}$, $10^5 \times \text{more accretion than Sgr A}^*$ ⇒Same angular shadow size, same characteristic near-horizon frequency of emission



Comprehensive set of Advanced Simulation Tools

- Plasma simulations (e.g. BHAC Code, Porth et al.):
- Ideal (soon non-ideal) 3D GRMHD
- Multiple coordinate systems
- Adaptive GRID
- Arbitrary space times
- **Ray Tracing** (e.g. RAPTOR, Bronzwaer, Moscibrodzka):
- Arbitrary space times
- Synchrotron abs/emission
- Thermal & non-thermal particles
- Polarization, Faraday rotation
- VLBI Simulator (MeqSilhouette, Dean et al.)
- Thermal noise
- Troposphere fluctuations
- Pointing errors, Bandpass
- Actual observing schedule
- Automatic VLBI Calibration Pipeline (e.g. CASA+rPICARD, Janssen)
- Multiple imaging algorithms
- Closure phase and Amplitude fitting, MEM (EHT Imaging, Chael et al.)
- Sparse Imaging (Akiyama) et al.

More codes within EHT: code-comparison

Virtual Reality 360° visualization of black hole at multiple radio frequencies

Davelaar, Bronzwaer, Moscibrodzka, HF, et al.

Jet Models with scattering



Radboud University Nijmegen

Moscibrodzka, HF et al. (2014)



The path towards event horizon imaging Radboud University Nijmegen



VLBA



VLBI from 3 cm to 3 mm

The path towards event horizon imaging





Intrinsic Radio Size of Sgr A*



Radboud University Nijmegen

The higher the radio frequency – the closer to the black hole. At 230 GHz the emission comes from the event horizon scale.



Falcke & Markoff, (2013, Class. & Quant. Gravity)





230 GHz VLBI with APEX (2013)



Radboud University Nijmegen



Lu et al. 2018, ApJ, in press

2017 global EHTC Campaign







Event Horizon Telescope Consortium

Event Horizon Telescope



About 200 individual EHT members ...

EHT2017 Data Analysis



Event Horizon Telescope

- 01/2017: EHT Dress Rehearsal
- 04/2017: observing run 6/10 days
- 06-07/2017: 1st Correlation pass
- 12/2017: SPT data arrives
- 01-04/2018: Correlation, Calibration & Engineering data release (Calibrators only)
 - 3 different VLBI software pipelines: HOPS, AIPS, CASA
- 05/2018: Engineering data release (Sgr A* & M87)
- 05-07/2018: Imaging Sgr A* and M87
 - 4 independent teams not talking to each other until joint workshop
- 08/2018: Science data (images) released for analysis ...
- 11/2018: Collaboration meeting
- Q1/2019: Publication of results ...

Calibrator image from VLBI with ALMA (at 3mm)



Closure imaging using MEM with the *EHT-imaging* library (Chael et al. 2018)

BU Blazar monitoring at 43 GHz with the VLBA (Jorstad & Marscher 2016)





Radboud University

Issaoun, Brinkerink, Johnson et al. (in prep.)

What we **might** see

Challenges: troposphere (10 sec), sparse array (max 5 stations), refractive scattering substructures (days), source variability (hours)



Johnson & Gwinn

 $0.0 T_{re}$

Radbo

Black Hole Simluations of M87

GRMHD Simulation

VLBI Observations

VLBA 43 GHz (higher sensitivity)

Walker et al. 2008

Monika Moscibrodzka, RU Nijmegen

Moscibrodzka, Falcke, Shiokawa (2016, A&A) (Using Harm3D - Gammie et al.)



VLBI Simulations of M87



Radboud University Nijmegen

M87 GRMHD Simulations

(BHAC/Raptor)

Simulated EHT2017 observation

(MeqSilhouete/rPICARD/EHT Imaging)



Davelaar et al., in prep.

Roelofs et al., in prep.

Rings in M87



Non-standard spacetimes





BHAC code

Mizuno et al. (2018, Nature Astronomy)





African mm-wave Telescope: Move SEST telescope to Namibia

A dedicated African mm-VLBI telescope for EHT, GMVA. investment cost: $\sim 5 \text{ M} \in +$ operations ...



Imaging with Africa mmwave telescope





Black Hole Shadow Simulations at 690 GHz (!)



Radboud University Nijmegen

Optical depth included Shadow size = $45 \mu as$ Resolution at 10000 km baseline = $8.9 \mu as$ Scattering blur kernel size = $2.5 \mu as$



Moscibrodzka et al. (Radoud Univ)

Space Interferometry: Event Horizon Imager (EHI)



Radboud University Nijmegen

Reconstructed Space-VLBI image Includes variability due to scattering and source variations



Martin-Neira, V.Kudriashov (ESA)

F. Roelofs et al. (2018, subm.)

Using EHT Imaging library from Andrew Chael

Conclusion





Radboud University

- Images of black holes shadows are no longer fantasy!
- Comprehensive tools exist to model black holes in GR (and alternatives) and match to observations.
- The EventHorizonTelescope will deliver images early 2019: rudimentary at first but still unique ...
- Images will become sharper with time: multiple epochs, higher frequency, +France, +Africa, Space ...
- A close pulsar would be great! Stars will constrain spin and mass better in any case (ESO GRAVITY).
- Sgr A* and M87 will stay around, allowing ever better tests of GR for centuries to come ...

Heino Falcke, Rome, July 4, 2018





h.falcke@astro.ru.nl



@hfalcke



Silhouette vs Shadow



GRMHD Simulation





GRMHD Simulation




GRMHD with isothermal jet



43 GHz 60°

Radboud University Nijmegen

Jet: Tp/Te=1, Te~const Disk: hot ADAF (Tp/Te~5) Jet: Tp/Te=1, Te~const Disk: "classical" 2-temperature ADAF (Tp/Te~25)



Moscibrodzka & Falcke (2013, A&AL) Moscibrodzka et al. (2014)

Sgr A* 3DGRMHD jet model



Radboud University Nijmegen

Three-dimensional general relativistic magneto-hydrodynamic fluid calculations with radiation transport



Moscibrodzka & Falcke (2013, A&A) Moscibrodzka et al. (2014, A&A)

230 GHz Predictions



Radboud University Nijmegen



Goal: constrain spin and orientation of black hole from shadow image!

Moscibrodzka et al. (2014)

GRMHD Simulations

BlackHoleCam



Sgr A*: Jet-model SED



Radboud University Nijmegen

2D jet-model with a mix of thermal particle distribution and non-thermal particles (kappa-distribution)



Davelaar, Moscibrodzka, Bronzwaer, Falcke A&A (2018), in press

scale)





- The shorter the wavelength, the smaller the radio source.
- At low frequencies the structure is blurred by scattering with λ^2 -law.
- \bullet At $\lambda7$ mm the radio source becomes slightly larger than the scattering.



VLBI Images of Sgr A* (to scale)



- The shorter the wavelength, the smaller the radio source.
- At low frequencies the structure is blurred by scattering with λ^2 -law.
- \bullet At $\lambda7$ mm the radio source becomes slightly larger than the scattering.

Scattering





Johnson & Gwinn (2015)





Intrinsic Radio Size of Sgr A*



Radboud University Nijmegen

The higher the radio frequency – the closer to the black hole. At 230 GHz the emission comes from the event horizon scale.



Falcke & Markoff, (2013, Class. & Quant. Gravity)

Radio Lags measured with ALMA & VLA



Radboud University Nijmegen

Flux evolution at different frequencies



Higher frequencies, lead lower frequencies delay is 30 – 90 min, size is ~1 light hour ⇒ relativistic outflow



Brinkerink et al. (2015, A&A) See also Yusef-Zadeh et al. (2009)

Asymmetric source structure at λ3mm (VLBA+LMT+GBT)



Asymmetric source structure: non-zero closure phases







The Shadow of a Black Hole





Predictions - Tucson 1998

Radboud University Nijmegen

The Central Parsecs of the Galaxy ASP Conference Series, Vol. 186, 1999 H. Falcke, A. Cotera, W.J. Duschl, F. Melia, M.J. Rieke, eds.

The Jet Model for Sgr A*

H. Falcke

Max-Planck-Institut für Radioastronomie, Auf dem Hügel 69, D-53121 Bonn, Germany

Steward Observatory, The University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ 85721

3.3. Predictions

A number of predictions from the jet model can be made that can be tested in the near future. Sgr A* should become resolved at 3 and 1 mm in the NS direction once a suitable mm-VLBI array is available. From analogy to other radio cores one would expect a polarization at the percent level at mmwavelengths where interstellar propagation effects become negligible (Bower et al. 1999a&b). The most likely direction of the magnetic field is probably along the jet axis (NS?). Because the outflow travels from small to large scales and from small to large wavelengths one would expect that radio outbursts appear first at high frequencies and then propagate to longer wavelengths. The time scale for this delay could be relatively short. The model also predicts a certain level of x-ray emission, since the relativistic electrons in the nozzle will inverse-Compton scatter their own synchrotron radiation into the soft x-ray regime. The luminosity, however, will be relatively low, of the order $\leq 10^{34}$ erg/sec with a

4. Outlook



Figure 4. Sketch of the inner region of Sgr A^* with accretion flow and nozzle surrounding the black hole. Overlaid is an appropriately scaled reproduction of a Figure from Bardeen (1973), showing the 'hole' of photons absorbed by the black hole if observed against a background source. A similar process could apply to Sgr A^* and its compact, high-frequency emission component.

Simulating and quantifying non-Einstein gravity



Radboud University Nijmegen

- New 3DGRMHD code BHAC (U. Frankfurt, Rezzolla)
- Adaptive mesh and arbitrary space times
- Example: Non-Einstein gravity with "Dilaton parameter" b:

 $ds^{2} = -\left(\frac{\rho - 2\mu}{\rho + 2b}\right)dt^{2} + \left(\frac{\rho + 2b}{\rho - 2\mu}\right)d\rho^{2} + (\rho^{2} + 2b\rho)d\Omega^{2} \qquad r^{2} = \rho^{2} + 2b\rho, \qquad M = \mu + b$

Rezzolla & Zhidenko (2014) metric expansion:

$$ds^{2} = -N^{2}(r)dt^{2} + \frac{B^{2}(r)}{N^{2}(r)}dr^{2} + r^{2}d\Omega^{2}$$

yields high accuracy approximation e.g. error of 1e-4 in $g_{\mu\nu}$ with seven expansion parameters

General axisymmetric spacetime also available: Konoplya et al. (2016)



Simulation credit: Yosuke Mizuno

Importance of electron heating **Radboud University Niimegen**



3D GRMHD density regions: Jet: single-temperature plasma: **Red: low density**, $T_{electron} \sim T_{proton}$ high magnetization Blue: high density, low magnetization Jet is lower density than disk $\dot{M}_{jet} \ll \dot{M}_{disk}$ Hence, needs to be hotter to radiate significantly: **Accretion flow:** T_{e. jet} T_{e disk} two-temperature plasma $T_{electron} \ll T_{proton}$

Moscibrodzka & Falcke (2013, A&A) & Moscibrodzka et al. (2014, A&A)



Sgr A* radio size



Two-dimensional structure of Sgr A*: fairly elongated



 Size at 43 GHz: (35.4 ±0.4) Rs × (12.6±5.5) Rs at PA (95±4)°







- Each antenna-antenna baseline "draws" a ring on the sky
- Interference between signals produces interferometry fringes
- The superposition of the information of many baselines (fringes) "draws" the image.







- Each antenna-antenna baseline "draws" a ring on the sky
- Interference between signals produces interferometry fringes
- The superposition of the information of many baselines (fringes) "draws" the image.





- Each antenna-antenna baseline "draws" a ring on the sky
- Interference between signals produces interferometry fringes
- The superposition of the information of many baselines (fringes) "draws" the image.





- Each antenna-antenna baseline "draws" a ring on the sky
- Interference between signals produces interferometry fringes
- The superposition of the information of many baselines (fringes) "draws" the image.



First VLBI-Results from Apex





230 GHz VLBI with APEX



Radboud University Nijmegen



Lu et al. 2018, subm.

EHT Closure phases at 1 mm



Radboud University Nijmegen



Fish et al. (2015, ApJ subm.)

See also "Polarization on EH scales": Johnston et al. (2015, Science, in press)



DITE I ULUICIS III LUIOPE G

Africa





- Amsterdam: Multiwavelength observations
- Bonn VLBI: Data correlation, APEX telescope
- ESO: ALMA telescope
- IRAM: Pico Veleta & NOEMA telescopes
- JIVE: Open Science VLBI analysis software
- Rhodes Univ.: VLBI Simulations
- Sweden: Polarisation calibration

Event Horizon Telescope Consortium



About 150 individual EHT members ...

Event Horizon Telescope Consortium



Event Horizon Telescope

13 EHT Stakeholders

- Harvard/SAO (USA)
- MIT Haystack Obs. (USA)
- Univ. Arizona (USA)
- Univ. Chicago (USA)
- Perimeter (Canada)
- INAOE (Mexico)
- MPIFR Bonn (Germany)
- IRAM (D/F/E)
- Radboud Uni. (Netherlands)
- Univ. Frankfurt (Germany)
- EACOA (East Asia)
- NOAJ (Japan)
- ASIAA (Taiwan)

14 M€ ERC Synergy Grant BlackHoleCam & EU partners



Hamburg Bremen **Onsla Space** IVF Observatory Berlin Hannovesweden) msterdam Braunschweig oMagdeburg en Haago Nie Radboud (Nijmegen) Leipzig sseno Antwerpen Dresd Deutschland Köln ento Brüssel **MPIfR Bonn** Belgien am tain Frankfurt **BlackHoleCam** Nürnberg Mannheim . Rezzolla Karlsruhe Numerical Stuttgart Relativity ESO & MPE GRTES Theory Salzburg H. Falcke M. Kramer Öste Black Hole Pulsars & 9 Astrophysics test of GR Liechtenstein & VI BI Rhodes Univ ich South Africa Genfo 6 U. Namibia FerraTRANS Grenoble Mailand Venedig Verona Turin

EU Players & Partners

- BlackHoleCam PIs:
 - Falcke (Radboud Nijmegen)
 - Rezolla (Frankfurt)
 - Kramer (MPIfR Bonn)
 - BHC Partners
 - Zensus (MPIfR Bonn)
 - Markoff (Amsterdam)
 - ESO: ALMA telescope
 - IRAM: Pico Veleta & NOEMA telescopes
 - JIVE: CASA
 - Rhodes Univ: VLBI Simulations
 - Bologna: CASA

VLBI hardware contributions



Event Horizon Telescope

Inventory VLBI Station Backend Equipment 2017 SAO & Other BHC MPIFR IRAM APEX 100% 90% 80% 70% 60% 50% 40% 30% 20% 10% 0% Calibration **Clock Unit** Recorders Harddisk **Phased Array** Atomic Frequency Digital Backend* Unit Modules** Clocks Converter

Note: not all columns are the same price ...

Mark 6 Recording:

2017: 32 Gbit/sec 2018: 64 Gbit/sec

0.5-1 Pbyte/Telescope

EHT VLBI equipment at IRAM 30m Pico Veleta (2017)





DBBC3 (parallel recording)

DownConverter + R2DBE

2018: Control Computer added

2019: Automatic upload of schedules





VLBI Real Time Monitor



Radboud University Nijmegen

Daily weather forecast from Dutch meterorological servce (KNMI) for all sites


VLBI Monitor



Mel 111 M87 SMTO 1058 1512-090 Q, CENA 1749+096 16293-24 80 163-301 / Cr 399 G45.1 G34.3 / GC 2688 1924-292 3C452232+117 LMT 0006-063

EHT VLBI live world map



EHT 2017 – Data Quality





First VLBI with ALMA in April 2017



Scientists stunned by first image of black hole





Ignacio Ruiz

Scattering





Johnson & Gwinn (2015)

EHT Data Analysis



- 01/2017: EHT Dress Rehearsal
- 03/2017: Operation Readiness Review
- 04/2017: 1st observing run 6/10 days
- 06-07/2017: 1st Correlation pass
- 10/2017: 1st Engineering data release (Calibrators only) & Data issues review (multiple software tools, multiple imaging challenges)
- 12/2017: SPT data arrives
- 01-02/2018: 2nd Engineering data release (Calibrators only) & Data issues review
- 04/2018: 2nd observing run
- 05/2018: Engineering data release 3 of 2017 Sgr A* and M87 data for calibration and checks
- 06-07/2018: Start imaging of Sgr A* and M87
- 01-02/2019: First publications?

NL contributions

- Theory:
 - GRMHD simulations (M. Moscibrodzka, J. Davelaar)
- Observing:
 - ~2/3 of VLBI equipment
 - Online Monitoring and Control of array (D. van Rossum)
 - Part of 5 telescope observing crews (e.g., S. Issaoun)
- Data Analysis Software:
 - New open source CASA VLBI functionality (JIVE/BlackHoleCam)

Poster P30

- rPICARD: Automatic CASA-VLBI pipeline (M. Janssen)
- MeqSilhouette VLBI Simulations coupled to rPICARD (R. Dean, U. Pretoria with F. Roelofs)
- Parameterextraction (Shan-Shan Zhao)
- Leadership:
 - Project management (R. Tilanus)
 - Science Council chair (H. Falcke)
 - EHT Board membership (W. Boland)
 - Multi-wavelength coordination (UA, S. Markoff)







Load and convert M (flag tables, ANTAB, Trec file	Metadata s. smodel lites)	surement Set - Lo	ad FITS-IDI files
Eeatures MPI support completely modular easy to add new functionalities	Automatic flagging heuristics based on autocorrelations (hequency space: identify obtained and the space standard derivative across chamels 	Correct field rotation angle, scalar bandpass (coming soon), a- priori calibration, correct for digital sampling (ACCOR)	Diagnostics print input parameters plois of calibration solution tables metedata overview flag tables summary file of observation plots of calibrated visibilities
full control over sensible input easy to re-run with a different strategy or using souce models	Manual phase calibration (instrument) phase and delay per spectral window using a bright calibrater)	Global fringe-fit: Find best solution parameters (e.g., vary over solint) (Cotter-Schwei)	
for multiple arrays (EHT,GMVA, VLBA,EVN,)	Complex bandpass	Polarization calibration (RL delay and phase offsets, D-terms)	



Picard: CASA VLBI Pipeline





M. Janssen (Radboud Univ)

MeqSilhouette + CASA Pipeline **Radboud University Niimegen**



New synthetic VLBI data generator based on MegTrees

(R. Deane, I. Natarajan, T. **Blecher**)

- Utilizes *atm* software to corrupt visibilities with atmospheric effects:
 - Turbulence
 - Attenuation
 - sky noise
 - based on station weather
 - temperature
 - ground pressure
 - Water Vapor
 - coherence time)
- antenna pointing errors and bandpass effects
- full Stokes soon



Current development

MeqSilhouette + CASA Pipeline + Metadata from **VLBI** Monitor

(F. Roelofs)

Compare synthetic data to actual EHT data \Rightarrow quantify black hole parameter uncertainties

Fitting optimal shadow model to get BH parameters





Broderick et al. (2016)



Multimessengers: Stars, Pulsars, EHT

- Shadow alone may not be enough
- Black-hole spin and quadrupole moment are ambiguous
- Add orthogonal constraint from orbits of stars and pulsars
- May allow tests of GR in strongly curved static space time.



Psaltis, Wex, Kramer (2016)

EHT and LIGO



Radboud University Nijmegen



Baker, Psaltis, Skordis (2015)



Gamsberg – 2347 m

Swazila Lesotho South Africa Grahamstown Port Elizabeth 🕴 💶 🎬 🌣 Mountain owned by Max-Planck Gesellschaft



Gamsberg – Weather

Radboud University Nijmegen

1mm VLBI weather ~ 50% of the year



F. Roeolfs based on model from S. Paine (SAO)

• ESO site survey:

- Benign weather
- Water vapor comparable to Paranal in dry season.
- Temp: 0-25°
- Wind: 5.6m/s avg (no major storms)
- Hardly any snow or icing
- Wet season: Jan-March

Sarazin (1994)







H. Falcke, AMT, Slide Nr. 88



H. Falcke, AMT, Slide Nr. 89



H. Falcke, AMT, Slide Nr. 90



SEST 15m at La Silla in Chile



Jens Kauffmann

MIT Haystack

could do $|\ell| < 60$ deg, |b| < 1 deg to reasonable depth in 3,000 h

time estimate:

models suggest bright lines throughout Milky Way could, e.g., map fraction of dense gas along spiral arm, shocks, feedback, etc.



Feasibility: Imaging the Milky Way

"Infrastructure"











Image reconstruction



Non-standard BHs





Mizuno et al. (2018, Nature Astronomy)





African mm-Wave Telescope

1mm VLBI weather ~ 50% of the year



• ESO site survey:

- Benign weather
- Water vapor comparable to Paranal in dry season.
- Temp: 0-25°
- Wind: 5.6m/s avg (no major storms)
- Hardly any snow or icing
- Wet season: Jan-March

Sarazin (1994)

Gamsberg – Annual Variation





*Visibility for African sites: Sgr A**



African mm-Wave Telescope



M87 visibility for African sites



African mm-Wave Telescope



Gamsberg in-situ measurement



African mm-Wave Telescope



Figure 1: Seasonal variation of precipitable H_2O computed on the basis of 20 days median from 1985-1993 Windhoek radiosonde night flights (full line) from the altitude of Gamsberg compared to 1983-1989 in situ Paranal (dotted line) and La Silla (dashed line) nighttime statistics. The Gamsberg in situ measurements are overplotted as filled squares.